

RANKIN
WILBOURNE

U N I O N
W I T H
C H R I S T

The Way to Know and Enjoy God

NOTES

INTRODUCTION

1. G. K. Chesterton, “Ethics of Elfland,” *Orthodoxy* (Chicago: Moody Classics, 2009), 82.
2. Chesterton, *Orthodoxy*, 82.
3. Albert Einstein, quoted in “What Life Means to Einstein: An Interview by George Sylvester Viereck,” *Saturday Evening Post*, October 26, 1929.
4. Walter Brueggemann, *Interpretation and Obedience: From Faithful Reading to Faithful Living* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991), 199.
5. It’s not a perfect analogy, and here’s one place the analogy breaks down: while physical DNA is with you from birth and you have no control over it or choice in the matter, the spiritual DNA of the Holy Spirit is given to you at a certain point in your life when God regenerates your heart and you respond in faith.
6. J. I. Packer, *Knowing God* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 1993), 218.
7. John Calvin, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, ed. John T. McNeill, trans. Ford Lewis Battles (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1960), 3.1.1.
8. C. S. Lewis, *Surprised by Joy* (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1984), 181.

CHAPTER 1: LIVING IN THE GAP

1. *Tender Mercies*, directed by Bruce Beresford (1983; Santa Monica, CA: Lionsgate, 2009), DVD.
2. “The Writer’s Almanac,” email, January 1, 2016.
3. John Newton, “Thoughts upon the African Slave Trade,” accessed February 29, 2016, <http://thriceholy.net/Texts/African.html>.
4. Ernest Hemingway, *The Sun Also Rises* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1954), 251.
5. T. S. Eliot, “East Coker,” *The Four Quartets* (San Diego: Harvest, 1971), 29.
6. John Calvin, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, ed. John T. McNeill, trans. Ford Lewis Battles (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1960), 3.11.10.
7. Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.11.10.
8. Jonathan Edwards, *The Works of Jonathan Edwards*, vol. 2, ed. Patrick H. Alexander (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1998), Kindle location 89700.
9. Thomas Goodwin, *Of Christ the Mediator*, cited in *A Puritan Theology: Doctrine for Life*, ed. Joel R. Beeke and Mark Jones (Grand Rapids, MI: Reformation Heritage Books, 2012), 483.
10. Robert Letham, *Union with Christ in Scripture, History, and Theology* (Phillipsburg, NJ: P&R, 2001), 1.
11. Lane G. Tipton, “Union with Christ and Justification,” in *Justified in Christ: God’s Plan for Us in Justification*, ed. K. Scott Oliphint (Fearn, Scotland: Mentor, 2007), 34.
12. Robert Reymond, *A New Systematic Theology of the Christian Faith*, 2nd ed. (Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 2010), dccclix.
13. J. Todd Billings, *Union with Christ* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2011), 1.
14. J. I. Packer, *A Quest for Godliness: The Puritan Vision of the Christian Life* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 1990), 202.
15. Marcus Peter Johnson, *One with Christ: An Evangelical Theology of Salvation* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2013), 29.
16. John Murray, *Redemption Accomplished and Applied* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1955), 161.
17. Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.11.10.

NOTES

18. John Owen, *Communion with the Triune God*, ed. Kelly M. Kapic and Justin Taylor (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2007), 123.
19. John Owen, quoted in *Puritan Theology*, ed. Beeke and Jones, 112.
20. John Owen, *An Exposition of the Epistle to the Hebrews*, in *The Works of John Owen*, vol. 20 (Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 1991), 148, cited in *Puritan Theology*, ed. Beeke and Jones, 483.
21. John Owen wrote, “‘The grace of our Lord Jesus Christ be with you all.’ Yea, [Paul] makes these two, ‘Grace be with you,’ and, ‘The Lord Jesus be with you’ to be equivalent expressions.” As quoted by Sinclair Ferguson, who added that this may be one of Owen’s most important theological insights: “Grace is, ultimately, personal. Grace is Jesus Christ; Jesus Christ is God’s grace. For grace is not substantial in the sense of being a quality or entity that can be abstracted from the person of the Savior.” Ferguson, *The Trinitarian Devotion of John Owen* (Lake Mary, FL: Reformation Trust, 2014), Kindle location 801.
22. C. S. Lewis, *The Last Battle* (New York: Collier, 1986), 163. Others have pointed out how central the theme of union with Christ is to the writing of C. S. Lewis (see Leanne Payne’s book *Real Presence*). This might explain why the notion of union with Christ is even vaguely familiar to many Christians, because it was so central for one of the twentieth century’s most significant Christian authors.

CHAPTER 2: UNION WITH CHRIST: WHAT IS IT?

1. John Calvin, *Commentary on Ephesians*, chap. V.32, cited in Marcus Peter Johnson, *One with Christ: An Evangelical Theology of Salvation* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2013), 49.
2. Richard Longenecker, *Word Biblical Commentary: Galatians* (Dallas: Word Books, 1990), 159.
3. Herman Ridderbos, *Paul: An Outline of His Theology* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1997), 38.
4. The Son of God assumed our full human nature to redeem our full human nature. Jesus was “born of woman” (Gal. 4:4) “in the likeness of sinful flesh” (Rom. 8:3). He was tempted in every way as we are, so that he is able to sympathize with us, and yet he was without sin (Heb. 4:15). Though he was innocent, he “gave himself for our sins” (Gal. 1:4) and died in our place (1

Pet. 3:18) to deliver us from the power of death (Heb. 2:14). He was raised for us (Rom. 4:25) that we too might pass from death to life (John 11:25). He “ascended far above all the heavens” (Eph. 4:10), where he sits “at the right hand of God” (Col. 3:1) and “lives to make intercession for [us]” (Heb. 7:25), as our “high priest forever” (Heb. 6:20).

5. Charles Wesley, “Christ the Lord Is Risen Today,” in *Trinity Hymnal* (Atlanta: Great Commission, 1990), 277.
6. Sinclair Ferguson, *The Holy Spirit* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 1996), 71.
7. John Murray, *Redemption Accomplished and Applied* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1955), 172.
8. John Calvin, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, ed. John T. McNeill, trans. Ford Lewis Battles (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1960), 3.11.10. *Mysticism* is a notoriously vague word in the history of Christian spirituality, but we shouldn’t let the abuses of this word prevent us from being staggered by the mystery of our union with Christ. For this reason, even these most careful of theologians, Murray and Calvin, do not hesitate to use the word *mysticism*. See chapter 6 for a fuller treatment.
9. Special thanks to my friend Paul Kim for this helpful analogy.
10. C. S. Lewis, *Letters to an American Lady*, ed. Clyde S. Kilby (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1967), 36–37.
11. Flannery O’Connor, *The Habit of Being* (New York: Noonday, 1995), 477.
12. To address concerns some readers may have about where I stand on the “New Perspective” on justification: I hold to the traditional Protestant understanding of justification as a legal, forensic, declarative verdict, the imputation of our sins to Christ and the imputation of his righteousness to us by faith. My interest in union with Christ is not to open the door to a concession on justification. My concern is that the desire to protect a historic understanding of justification has led to an overcorrection, and subsequently to our letting go of the overriding importance of union with Christ as the *ground* of both justification and sanctification. Such that union with Christ, if it is mentioned at all, gets reduced to some aspect of what happens *after* salvation. It gets reduced to an aspect of Christian experience, rather than the foundation of it. Consequently, our focus has shifted to understanding the mechanics of Christ’s work, often divorced from Christ’s person. Doctrine can then become abstract, something to be understood and mastered. This is perhaps why some seem to love theology more

than we love people, even more than we love God, because we concentrate on wanting others to understand the work of Christ, as opposed to emphasizing that Christ's work always flows out of what is even more basic than our understanding of it, that is, our actual communion with God through the person of Christ. Theology is important, even vital. This book is all about theology. And yet, it is not our theology, or the presumed accuracy of it, that saves us. It is the perfect Christ who saves us, not our imperfect theology or our imperfect faith. For more on this idea, see Marcus Peter Johnson's important book, *One with Christ*, pages 52–53.

13. While many have made this point, see especially James B. Torrance, *Worship, Community and the Triune Grace of God* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 1996), 34.

CHAPTER 3: WHY WE NEED IT: TWO SONGS PLAYING IN OUR HEADS

1. See Jay Parini, *The Last Station: A Novel of Tolstoy's Final Year* (New York: Knopf Doubleday, 2010).
2. See the book *unChristian* by David Kinnaman and Gabe Lyons, full of research about perceptions of the church today. "One of the surprising insights from our research is that the growing hostility toward Christians is very much a reflection of what outsiders feel they receive from believers. They say their aggression simply matches the oversized opinions and egos of Christians. One outsider put it this way: 'Most people I meet assume that *Christian* means very conservative, entrenched in their thinking, antigay, antichoice, angry, violent, illogical, empire builders; they want to convert everyone, and they generally cannot live peacefully with anyone who doesn't believe what they believe'" ([Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 2007], 26).
3. Brennan Manning, *All Is Grace: A Ragamuffin Memoir* (Colorado Springs: David C Cook, 2011), 192–94. This quote is from a later book, but it distills the essence of the controlling idea in Manning's earlier works.
4. This was a theme Nouwen returned to over and over in his works—receiving the love of God, letting yourself be loved by God, being the beloved. As he put it, "The question is not 'How am I to know God?' but 'How am I to let myself be known by God?' And, finally, the question is not 'How am I to love God?' but 'How am I to let myself be loved by God?' God is looking into the distance for me, trying to find me, and longing to bring me home." *The Return of the Prodigal Son* (New York: Image Doubleday, 1994), 106.

5. See Kenneth E. Bailey's book *The Cross and the Prodigal*, which highlights the significance of the father running toward his son.
6. Tobias Wolff, *Old School* (New York: Vintage, 2004), 195.
7. For a masterful extended treatment of this story, see Timothy Keller's *The Prodigal God*.
8. Dietrich Bonhoeffer, *The Cost of Discipleship* (New York: Collier-Macmillan, 1963), 45, 47, 55, 60.
9. Bonhoeffer, *Cost of Discipleship*, 55. This might offend some sensibilities, so it's worth quoting John Calvin also at this point. "For when [repentance] is rightly understood it will better appear how man is justified by faith alone, and simple pardon; nevertheless actual holiness of life, so to speak, is not separated from free imputation of righteousness." *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, ed. John T. McNeill, trans. Ford Lewis Battles (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1960), 3.3.1. He's saying there is no justification without sanctification.
10. Manning, *All Is Grace*, 194.
11. Bonhoeffer, *Cost of Discipleship*, 58.
12. Bonhoeffer, *Cost of Discipleship*, 55.
13. Dallas Willard, *The Great Omission: Rediscovering Jesus' Essential Teachings on Discipleship* (San Francisco: HarperOne, 2006), 226.
14. Dallas Willard, *The Divine Conspiracy: Rediscovering Our Hidden Life in God* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1998), 41.
15. Willard, *Divine Conspiracy*, 37.
16. Willard, *Divine Conspiracy*, 301.
17. It is striking that the twentieth-century theologian Karl Barth lists sloth alongside pride as the deadliest of the deadly sins.
18. "Indeed, we shall not say that, properly speaking, God is known where there is no religion or piety." Calvin, *Institutes*, 1.2.1. Calvin here and elsewhere insists that piety—real life correspondence to God's character—is inseparable from any true knowledge of God.
19. I'm deliberately referring to two books in conversation with each other: *Radical* by David Platt and *Ordinary* by Michael Horton. This conversation is an example of the tension between these two songs that the church is facing today.
20. Bonhoeffer, *Cost of Discipleship*, 74, 76.

NOTES

21. Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.11.10.
22. Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.11.6.
23. Calvin, *Commentary on John 6*, “They sought in Christ something other than Christ himself,” cited in Julie Canlis’s essay, “Sonship, Identity and Transformation,” in *Sanctification: Explorations in Theology and Practice* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2014), Kindle location 3731.
24. Paraphrased from Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.11.6 in Richard B. Gaffin, “Justification and Union with Christ,” in *A Theological Guide to Calvin’s Institutes: Essays and Analysis*, ed. David W. Hall and Peter A. Lillback (Phillipsburg, NJ: P&R, 2008), 268.
25. Leo Tolstoy, *My Religion*, quoted in *Religion from Tolstoy to Camus*, ed. Walter Kaufmann (New Brunswick: Transaction, 1961), 45.
26. Quoted in Phillip Yancey, *The Jesus I Never Knew* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2002), 138.
27. Quoted in Yancey, *Jesus I Never Knew*, 139.
28. See www.fightthenewdrug.org.
29. Let’s take an example of a socially approved medicating agent: work. The addiction cycle runs like this:
 - Step 1: Pain, anxiety, feelings of inferiority. These are an inescapable part of life.
 - Step 2: Medicating agent—we seek to salve our pain through, in this example, working hard or doing a good job to validate ourselves.
 - Step 3: Temporary relief—praise! Reward! Accolades and achievement! It works, temporarily ...
 - Step 4: Negative consequences—but your relationships suffer from your overwork. Or your body starts to give out from the stress.
 - Step 5: Shame/guilt—Why am I doing this? Why am I working so hard? Why am I neglecting what I know is more important, my relationships? Which only makes you feel worse and leads you back to step 1.And the hook is set. You become stuck in a circular pattern of negative reinforcement. You know you’re addicted when you seek to medicate yourself with the very substance that sent you spiraling downward in the first place. For more on this cycle, see Robert Hemfelt and Richard Fowler, *Serenity: A Companion for Twelve Step Recovery* (Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 2010), 22–23.

30. Here I'm speaking generally about all idols that might enslave us, but there are certainly some addictions that require the help of a supportive recovery community in order to overcome.

CHAPTER 4: UNION WITH CHRIST IN THE BIBLE

1. Sandra Richter, *The Epic of Eden: A Christian Entry into the Old Testament* (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2008), 18.
2. Richter, *Epic of Eden*, 15.
3. Richard B. Hays and N. T. Wright have done a great service to New Testament scholarship by highlighting the narrative substructure of the New Testament, understanding it as the culmination of Israel's story.
4. A great complement to Richter's book is Greg Beale's *The Temple and the Mission of God*. Beale and Richter together show how at its heart the temple has always been about the presence of God. "Let them make me a sanctuary, that I may dwell in their midst" (Exod. 25:8). They show how the iconography of the temple (cherubim, palm trees, flowers and fruit, rivers and gold) as it unfolds through the Bible always looks back to the Garden of Eden even as it always looks ahead to the New Jerusalem.
5. Luke 24:27; Gen. 12:3; 2 Sam. 7:12–13; 2 Cor. 1:20; John 5:39.
6. Matt. 3:15; Gal. 3:13; Ps. 23:1; John 10:11; John 1:29; Heb. 2:14; 1 John 3:8.
7. 1 Cor. 15:3; 1 Cor. 2:2; 1 Pet. 1:19.
8. Jonathan Edwards writes, "What is it which chiefly makes you desire to go to heaven when you die? ... Is the main reason, that you may be with God, have communion with Him, and be conformed to Him? That you may see God and enjoy Him there? Is this the consideration which keeps your hearts, and your desires, and your expectations toward heaven? ... Could you be content to stand in no child-like relation to God, enjoying no gracious intercourse with Him, having no right to be acknowledged by Him as His children? Or would such a life as this, though in ever so great earthly prosperity, be esteemed by you a miserable life?" in "God the Best Portion of the Christian," in *The Works of Jonathan Edwards*, vols. 1–2 (Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 2011), Kindle locations 59215–59219, 59240–59241.
9. If you're interested in reading more about this theme, John Walton's books are a great place to start, in particular *The Lost World of Genesis One* and *Ancient Near Eastern Thought and the Old Testament*.

10. “The Pauline theme of union with Christ has risen to prominence in the current world of New Testament scholarship.” Constantine Campbell, *Paul and Union with Christ* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2012), 31. Of particular interest has been the relationship of union with Christ and justification, with some seeming to think that union with Christ has made justification (as understood by the Protestant reformers) less central or important, or that it has made the imputation of Christ’s righteousness unnecessary. That’s not my conviction. We don’t have to choose between justification and union with Christ. We can hold on to justification as a forensic, onetime legal declaration and, at the same time, have a robust understanding of the importance of union with Christ. Nor am I interested in parsing out whether union with Christ is the grounds of justification or if, on the other hand, justification is that which makes union possible. That remains a hot topic among some Reformed theologians. What I hope all sides can agree on is that union with Christ is important, has too long been neglected, and needs to be restored and reemphasized. For further reading on the importance of union with Christ to the apostle Paul, see Richard B. Gaffin Jr., *By Faith, Not by Sight: Paul and the Order of Salvation* (Phillipsburg, NJ: P&R, 2013).
11. Campbell, *Paul and Union with Christ*, 441.
12. Lewis B. Smedes, *Union with Christ: A Biblical View of the New Life in Jesus Christ* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1983), 55.
13. Nicolaus Cabasilas, *Life in Christ*, trans. Margaret I. Lisney (London: Janus, 1995), 5, cited in Robert Letham, *Union with Christ: In Scripture, History, and Theology* (Phillipsburg, NJ: P&R, 2011), 99.
14. Dallas Willard quotes I. Howard Marshall, saying that over the course of sixteen years he recalled hearing only two sermons on the kingdom of God, and commented, “I find this silence rather surprising because it is universally agreed by New Testament scholars that the central theme of the teaching of Jesus was the Kingdom of God.” Cited in *The Divine Conspiracy: Rediscovering Our Hidden Life in God* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1998), 59.
15. Tony Lane, quoted in Robert Letham, *Union with Christ: In Scripture, History, and Theology* (Phillipsburg, NJ: P&R, 2011), 7. That’s not a perfect analogy because electricity is an impersonal force, but the implication is striking: unless we are connected to Christ, personally and vitally, all that he has done for us remains without power or value to us.
16. We’ll look more at how our union with Christ changes our experience of reading the Bible in chapter 12.

17. To take a striking example, a preacher I respect for his unwavering commitment to grace is Paul Zahl. He says in his book *Grace in Practice*, “Grace ... comes under criticism in three of the larger letters of the New Testament: Hebrews, James and Second Peter” (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2007), 51. He continues, “Hebrews damages grace ... it is therefore at odds with the theology expressed almost everywhere else in the New Testament.” He adds, “James comes to a different conclusion [from Paul] ... these positions are incompatible” (52–53). I’ll provide one more example: “I am saying,” Zahl says, “that the canon within the canon of grace covers just about all, but not absolutely all, of the biblical data ... are there exceptions to this? Yes but these are obvious exceptions. They stand out because of their inconsistency” (55). We need preachers like Zahl, who preach God’s grace in the way it is meant, to shock our sensibilities. And yet, he presents a clear example of a *false choice* between Paul and James, or between Jesus and Hebrews. He assumes that we have to choose. What I appreciate about Zahl is that he has the courage and consistency to be honest about his convictions. Other writers and speakers, who might implicitly follow the same line of thought, would never be so bold, but this is how we may in practice still read the Bible. We turn down the warnings, for example, of Hebrews because we are not sure how to square them with God’s grace. We just might not be as honest about our underlying convictions as Zahl. This book will argue that because of union with Christ you are not forced to make these false choices.
18. James 1:6–8; cf. 1:26; 2:9. It is fascinating that James never mentions the crucifixion or the resurrection of Jesus, even though they were obviously pivotal in his own life (1 Cor. 15:7). What could explain James not mentioning what is central to the faith? Only if he assumes his readers have already heard the good news and now he is explicating for them what a life of integrity, one that is not “double-minded,” looks like (James 1:8). If you are in Christ, then this is the life to which Christ calls you. Examine yourself. But if you are in Christ, this is the life Christ can now give you. The union with Christ that James assumes (you couldn’t be accused of adultery—James 4:4—unless you were married to Christ) thus allows you to read James at full volume, as opposed to James being “incompatible” with the apostle Paul. You can say the same thing for 1 John or Amos or Isaiah or any of the Old Testament prophets. For example, without turning down the warnings of Amos 5 or Isaiah 1, if you truly know God (Hos. 6:1–3), then your life will be marked by authentic worship, a concern to do good, and a love of justice. And if it doesn’t look like this, then you don’t truly know God. What God commands, God enables by dwelling within—if indeed he does.

CHAPTER 5: UNION WITH CHRIST IN THE HISTORIC TRADITION

1. “I know the place; it may perhaps be superstitious, but, whenever I go to Oxford, I cannot help running to the spot where Jesus Christ first revealed Himself to me, and gave me the new birth.” Whitefield continues, “I read a little further, and discovered that they who know anything of religion know it is a vital union with the Son of God—Christ formed in the heart. O what a ray of divine life did then break in upon my soul! ... From that moment God has been carrying on His blessed work in my soul.” Quoted in L. Tyerman, *The Life of the Rev. George Whitefield*, vol. 1 (New York: Anson D. F. Randolph, 1877), 27.
2. Henry Scougal, *The Life of God in the Soul of Man* (Mansfield Centre, CT: Martino, 2011), 30.
3. I’m not a professional theologian by training, only a pastoral one by trade, so professionals in each of these fields covered will have to forgive my oversimplifications.
4. Hans Boersma, *Heavenly Participation: The Weaving of a Sacramental Tapestry* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2011), Kindle locations 39–40.
5. Robert Reymond, *A New Systematic Theology of the Christian Faith*, 2nd ed. (Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 2010), dccclix.
6. For further reading, see William B. Evans, *Imputation and Impartation* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2008), where he traces the development of and different understandings of union with Christ in the Reformed tradition.
7. Irenaeus, *Against Heresies*, bk. 3, chap. 19, par. 1, quoted in Donald Fairbairn, *Life in the Trinity: An Introduction to Theology with the Help of the Church Fathers* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2009), Kindle locations 794–97. Emphasis added.
8. Athanasius, *On Incarnation*, par. 54, cited in Fairbairn, *Life in the Trinity*, Kindle location 350.
9. Saint Augustine of Hippo, *The Trinity, XIII.12* (Hyde Park, NY: New City, 1991), 354.
10. Fairbairn, *Life in the Trinity*, 6–7. Fairbairn’s book is particularly helpful in demonstrating that the early church often talked about the gospel in ways we have lost hold of today. I am indebted to Marcus Peter Johnson for directing me toward Fairbairn’s work on this subject.

11. Charles Williams, *Descent of the Dove* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1939), 28.
12. Williams, *Descent of the Dove*, 28.
13. At the conclusion of his book *Participation in Christ: An Entry into Karl Barth's Church "Dogmatics,"* Adam Neder shows there is a great diversity and breadth in how the words *theosis* or *deification* have been and can be understood and makes a strong and welcome case for the widespread recovery of this language across theological traditions, East and West (Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 2009).
14. Calvin references Bernard second in frequency only to Augustine, and these are the only two writers that he almost always cites approvingly. See Dennis E. Tamburello, *Union with Christ: John Calvin and the Mysticism of St. Bernard* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 1994).
15. Like the early church fathers, Bernard frequently equated the Holy Spirit's presence as a kiss on the believer's life.
16. Bernard of Clairvaux, "Sermon 2.II.3," in *Classics of Western Spirituality, Bernard of Clairvaux: Selected Works* (New York: Paulist, 1987), 217.
17. Martin Luther, *Luther's Works, Vol. 31: Career of the Reformer*, ed. J. J. Pelikan, H. C. Oswald, and H. T. Lehmann (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1999), 351.
18. In recent years, Lutheran scholars in Finland have argued for the recognition of a more central place of union with Christ in Luther's theology. See Carl E. Braaten and Robert W. Jenson, eds., *Union with Christ: The New Finnish Interpretation of Luther* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1998). I am not convinced by the Finnish School's claim that it's the *center* of his theology, but it does seem indisputable that union with Christ was important to Luther. For more on union with Christ in Luther and Calvin, see Marcus Peter Johnson, *One with Christ: An Evangelical Theology of Salvation* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2013), 51–57.
19. And apparently, I was not alone in my surprise. "What was shocking to me," writes theologian Marcus Peter Johnson, "was the way in which Calvin spoke of salvation." Johnson, *One with Christ*, 11. I read Johnson's book while writing this one and felt like I had discovered a kindred spirit, as he shares my passion for recovering union with Christ. If you want a sampling of great historical quotes on the subject or a detailed look at how union with Christ frames "the order of salvation," you should most certainly read Johnson's book.
20. John Calvin, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, ed. John T. McNeill, trans. Ford Lewis Battles (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1960), 3.11.11.

NOTES

21. Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.11.10.
22. Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.1.1.
23. One of the best quotes on the significance of union with Christ in all of Calvin's writings is: "When we see that the whole sum of our salvation and every single part of it, are comprehended in Christ, we must beware of deriving the minutest portion of it from any other quarter. If we seek salvation, we are taught by the very name of Jesus that he possesses it. If we seek any other gifts of the Spirit, we shall find them in his unction; strength in his government; purity in his conception; indulgence in his nativity, in which he was made like us in all respects, in order that he might learn to sympathize with us. If we seek redemption, we shall find it in his passion; acquittal in his condemnation; remission of the curse in his cross; satisfaction in his sacrifice; purification in his blood; reconciliation in his descent into hell; mortification of the flesh in his sepulcher; newness of life in his resurrection; immortality also in his resurrection; the inheritance of a celestial kingdom in his entrance into heaven; protection, security, and the abundant supply of all blessings, in his kingdom; secure anticipation of judgment in the power of judging committed to him. In fine, since in him all kinds of blessings are treasured up, let us draw a full supply from him, and none from any other quarter." Calvin, *Institutes*, 2.16.19.
24. B. B. Warfield, "On Calvin as a Theologian," Third Millennium Ministries, accessed March 22, 2016, www.thirdmill.org/newfiles/bb_warfield/Warfield.Calvin.pdf.
25. J. I. Packer, *A Quest for Godliness: The Puritan Vision of the Christian Life* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 1990), 201.
26. R. Tudor Jones, quoted in John Jefferson Davis, *Meditation and Communion with God: Contemplating Scripture in an Age of Distraction* (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2012), 46.
27. Thomas Goodwin, *Of Christ the Mediator*, cited in *A Puritan Theology: Doctrine for Life*, ed. Joel R. Beeke and Mark Jones (Grand Rapids, MI: Reformation Heritage Books, 2012), 483.
28. "As the bifurcation of union with Christ became complete, the theme itself also become superfluous as an umbrella concept unifying justification and sanctification. To speak of a federal or legal union with Christ is simply to describe justification without remainder. Likewise, to speak of a vital union is to speak of sanctification. To the extent that the theme of union with Christ remains present in the successors of Hodge and Berkhof, it is largely

- vestigial ... The religious implications of this federal trajectory should also be carefully noted ... the bifurcation of forensic and transformatory categories made it virtually impossible to grasp the essential unity of salvation, and the Christian is left with an unstable dialectic tending toward legalism one moment, and antinomianism the next.” William Evans, *Imputation and Impartation: Union with Christ in American Reformed Theology* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2008), 237.
29. B. B. Warfield, *Faith and Life: “Conferences” in the Oratory of Princeton Seminary* (London: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1916), 422–23.
 30. John Murray, *Redemption Accomplished and Applied* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1955), 161.
 31. Sinclair Ferguson, *The Holy Spirit* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 1996), 100.
 32. Reymond, *New Systematic Theology*, dcccix.
 33. John Owen, *An Exposition of the Epistle to the Hebrews*, in *The Works of John Owen* (Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 1991), 20:148, cited in *A Puritan Theology*, ed. Beeke and Jones, 483.
 34. Sinclair Ferguson, *The Trinitarian Devotion of John Owen* (Lake Mary, FL: Reformation Trust, 2014), 64.
 35. See John Owen, *Communion with the Triune God*, ed. Kelly M. Kavic and Justin Taylor (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2007).
 36. Jonathan Edwards, quoted in George M. Marsden, *Jonathan Edwards: A Life* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2003), 463.
 37. Edwards, quoted in Marsden, *Jonathan Edwards*, 463.
 38. Michael J. McClymond and Gerald R. McDermott, *The Theology of Jonathan Edwards* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 38.
 39. For a full-length development of this theme, see John Piper, *God Is the Gospel: Meditations on God’s Love as the Gift of Himself* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2005).
 40. Edwards, quoted in Marsden, *Jonathan Edwards*, 463.
 41. McClymond and McDermott, *Theology*, 8.
 42. *The Works of Jonathan Edwards*, vols. 1–2 (Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 2011), Kindle location 89700.

NOTES

43. Karl Barth, *Church Dogmatics*, IV 3.2., quoted in Neder, *Participation*, Kindle location 68.
44. Neder, *Participation*, Kindle location 72.
45. T. F. Torrance, *Incarnation: The Person and Life of Christ* (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2008).
46. See above all Bonhoeffer's *Ethics*.
47. C. S. Lewis, *Mere Christianity*, IV.4 (London: Fount Paperbacks, 1982), 149–50.
48. See Timothy Ware, *The Orthodox Church: An Introduction to Eastern Christianity* (New York: Penguin Books, 1997).
49. See Julie Canlis, *Calvin's Ladder: A Spiritual Theology of Ascent and Ascension* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2010); Michael S. Horton, *Covenant and Salvation* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 2007); and Bruce L. McCormack, ed., *Justification in Perspective: Historical Developments and Contemporary Challenges* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2006).
50. See Constantine Campbell, *Paul and Union with Christ: An Exegetical and Theological Study* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2012).

CHAPTER 6: WHATEVER HAPPENED TO UNION WITH CHRIST?

1. Alan Lightman, *The Accidental Universe: The World You Thought You Knew* (New York: Vintage Books, 2013), 15.
2. John Murray, *Redemption Accomplished and Applied* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1955), 161, 170.
3. Kevin DeYoung, *The Hole in Our Holiness: Filling the Gap between Gospel Passion and the Pursuit of Godliness* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2012), Kindle location 1379.
4. B. F. Westcott, quoted in Lewis B. Smedes, *Union with Christ: A Biblical View of the New Life in Jesus Christ* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1983), 58.
5. Smedes, *Union with Christ*, 59.
6. Gerard Manley Hopkins, "God's Grandeur," Poetry Foundation, accessed March 23, 2016, www.poetryfoundation.org/poem/173660.

7. G. K. Chesterton, *Orthodoxy: The Romance of Faith* (Chicago: Moody, 2009), 81, 89.
8. Charles Taylor, *A Secular Age* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap, 2007), 25.
9. Taylor, *Secular Age*, 542.
10. Taylor, *Secular Age*, 27. For helpful summaries of Charles Taylor, see James K. A. Smith's *How (Not) to Be Secular* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2014) and Timothy Keller's *Walking with God through Pain and Suffering* (New York: Dutton, 2013), 53–54.
11. Against the strident insistence that faith and science are incompatible (espoused by Richard Dawkins), see, among others, Francis S. Collins, *The Language of God: A Scientist Presents Evidence for Belief* (New York: Free Press, 2006).
12. Steven Jay Gould, “The Meaning of Life,” *Life*, December 1988.
13. Chesterton, *Orthodoxy*, 36.
14. Shakespeare, *Hamlet*, 1.5.166–67, Shakespeare Online, accessed March 23, 2016, http://shakespeare-online.com/plays/hamlet_1_5.html.
15. MMPI Newsom, Archer, Trumbetta, and Gottesman 2003, cited in Jean M. Twenge, et al., “Egos Inflating Over Time: A Cross-Temporal Meta-Analysis of the Narcissistic Personality Inventory,” Research Gate, August 2008, www.researchgate.net/publication/5342670_Egos_Inflating_Over_Time_A_Cross-Temporal_Meta-Analysis_of_the_Narcissistic_Personality_Inventory.
16. John Calvin, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, ed. John T. McNeill, trans. Ford Lewis Battles (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1960), 3.1.1–2.
17. Sinclair Ferguson, *The Holy Spirit* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 1996), 72.
18. J. I. Packer, *Keep in Step with the Spirit* (Tarrytown, NY: Revell, 1984), 66.
19. Frederick Dale Bruner, *The Holy Spirit: Shy Member of the Trinity* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2001).
20. Richard F. Lovelace, *Dynamics of Spiritual Life* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 1979), 131.
21. Ferguson, *Holy Spirit*, 12.
22. Conversely, a deeper understanding of union with Christ will necessarily lead to a deeper experience of the Holy Spirit, and holds potential to bring these camps together and guard each from error.

NOTES

23. Hans Boersma, *Heavenly Participation: The Weaving of a Sacramental Tapestry* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2011), 3.
24. Murray, *Redemption*, 166.
25. D. A. Carson, quoted in Marcus Peter Johnson, *One with Christ: An Evangelical Theology of Salvation* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2013), 47.
26. Murray, *Redemption*, 172.
27. D. A. Carson adds, “Moreover, the word *spirituality* today is often ‘such an ill-defined, amorphous entity that it covers all kinds of phenomenon an earlier generation of Christians ... would have dismissed as error, even as ‘paganism’ or ‘heathenism.’” Quoted in Klaus Issler, *Wasting Time with God: A Christian Spirituality of Friendship with God* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2001), Kindle location 212.
28. Augustine, quoted in Boersma, *Heavenly Participation*, Kindle location 38.
29. DeYoung, *Hole in Our Holiness*, Kindle location 1379.
30. This is a point J. Todd Billings stresses in his excellent book *Union with Christ: Reframing Theology and Ministry for the Church* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2011).
31. J. R. R. Tolkien, “On Fairy Stories,” in *Tree and Leaf* (New York: HarperCollins, 2001), 69. Special thanks to Timothy Keller for drawing my attention to this essay.
32. C. S. Lewis, *The Weight of Glory* (London: Collier Macmillan, 1980), 18.
33. Tolkien, “On Fairy Stories,” 71–72.
34. Lewis, *Weight of Glory*, 16–17.

CHAPTER 7: A NEW IDENTITY: WHO AM I?

1. Ralph Ellison, interviewed by Alfred Chester and Vilma Howard, *Paris Review*, www.theparisreview.org/interviews/5053/the-art-of-fiction-no-8-ralph-ellison.
2. F. Scott Fitzgerald, *The Great Gatsby* (New York: Collier Books, 1992), 71.
3. *Rocky*, directed by John G. Avildsen (1976), quoted at IMDB, accessed March 23, 2016, www.imdb.com/title/tt0075148/quotes.
4. I first read this idea in Lewis B. Smedes, *Union with Christ: A Biblical View of the New Life in Jesus Christ* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1983),

109. Smedes writes, “Christian self-understanding is found outside of the Christian.”
5. Epictetus famously put it, “Men are disturbed not by things, but by the view which they take of them.”
 6. Carol Dweck, *Mindset: The New Psychology of Success* (New York: Random, 2008), 15. “Your mindset is all about your beliefs,” writes Professor Dweck in her bestseller. “Your beliefs are the key to your happiness,” she adds. Dweck says she wrote her book out of a concern for her students, most of whom assumed their mindsets were fixed. “But your mindset is all about your beliefs and your beliefs can change.” Here is a bestseller, written by a renowned social scientist from a secular perspective, but saying something very similar to the apostle Paul in the New Testament.
 7. *Frozen*, directed by Chris Buck and Jennifer Lee (Burbank, CA: Walt Disney Animation Studios, 2013).
 8. David Brooks, *The Road to Character* (New York: Random, 2015), Kindle location 244.
 9. Charles Taylor, *The Ethics of Authenticity* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1991), 23.
 10. Dale S. Kuehne, *Sex and the iWorld: Rethinking Relationship Beyond an Age of Individualism* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2009), 32.
 11. Robert N. Bellah, et al., *Habits of the Heart: Individualism and Commitment in American Life* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1985), 27.
 12. Kanye West, quoted in Ann Oldenburg, “Bruce Jenner: Kanye’s Wise Words Helped Kim Accept Transition,” *USA Today*, April 24, 2015, <http://entertainthis.usatoday.com/2015/04/24/bruce-jenner-kanyes-wise-words-helped-kim-accept-transition/>.
 13. Barry Schwartz, “The Paradox of Choice,” TED, July 2005, www.ted.com/talks/barry_schwartz_on_the_paradox_of_choice/transcript?language=en.
 14. *Planned Parenthood v. Casey*, 505 U.S. 833 (Justices Kennedy, Souter, and O’Connor).
 15. Alain Ehrenberg, *The Weariness of the Self: Diagnosing the History of Depression in the Contemporary Age* (Montreal: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2009), back cover copy.

NOTES

16. Schwartz, "Paradox," www.ted.com/talks/barry_schwartz_on_the_paradox_of_choice/transcript?language=en.
17. Ellison, *Paris Review*, www.theparisreview.org/interviews/5053/the-art-of-fiction-no-8-ralph-ellison. Jonathan Franzen's novel *Freedom* makes a similar point that the freedom we so casually speak about and so easily champion often brings with it shackles that we didn't foresee.
18. W. H. Auden, "In Memory of W. B. Yeats," section 1.
19. J. Todd Billings, *Union with Christ: Reframing Theology and Ministry for the Church* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2011), 15.
20. Billings, "Salvation as Adoption in Christ," chapter 1 in *Union with Christ*.
21. See Martin Luther, *On Christian Liberty*: "Faith ... unites the soul with Christ as a bride is united with her bridegroom ... It follows that everything they have they hold in common, the good as well as the evil. Accordingly the believing soul can boast of and glory in whatever Christ has as though it were its own, and whatever the soul has Christ claims as his own." *Luther's Works, Vol. 31: Career of the Reformer I*, ed. J. J. Pelikan, H. C. Oswald, and H. T. Lehmann (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1999), 351.
22. Thanks to my friend and colleague Paul Kim for this illustration.
23. Schwartz, "Paradox," www.ted.com/talks/barry_schwartz_on_the_paradox_of_choice/transcript?language=en.
24. The phrase "center and circumference" is from Smedes, *Union with Christ*, xii.
25. Ralph Ellison, *Invisible Man* (New York: Knopf Doubleday, 2010), 243.
26. J. I. Packer, *Knowing God* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 1993) 202, 206.
27. Dietrich Bonhoeffer, *Letters and Papers from Prison* (New York: Collier Macmillan, 1972), 348.
28. Victor Hugo, *Les Misérables*, trans. Charles E. Wilbour (New York: Modern Library, 1992), 96–97.
29. Quoted in *Seeing through the Eye: Malcolm Muggeridge on Faith*, ed. Cecil Kuhne (San Francisco: Ignatius, 2005), 5.
30. We need a different J. C. than Jiminy Cricket to help us, and I don't think the coincidence is incidental.
31. "Americans in Paris," *This American Life*, WBEZ, July 28, 2000, www.thisamericanlife.org/radio-archives/episode/165/americans-in-paris.

CHAPTER 8: A NEW HORIZON: WHERE AM I HEADED?

1. Walker Percy, quoted in Diogenes Allen, *Spiritual Theology: The Theology of Yesterday for Spiritual Help Today* (Cambridge, MA: Cowley, 1997), Kindle locations 285–88.
2. Walker Percy, “The Holiness of the Ordinary,” *Signposts in a Strange Land* (New York: Noonday, 1991), 369.
3. Friedrich Nietzsche, *Twilight of the Idols*, 1.12.
4. Walter Brueggemann, *Genesis*, Interpretation: A Bible Commentary for Teaching and Preaching (Atlanta: John Knox, 1982), 32.
5. See Anthony A. Hoekema’s *Created in God’s Image* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1994) for a good historical, theological survey.
6. J. Richard Middleton, *The Liberating Image: The Imago Dei in Genesis 1* (Grand Rapids, MI: Brazos, 2005), 109–10.
7. Middleton, *Liberating Image*, 104.
8. Middleton calls it “a genuine democratization of ancient Near Eastern royal ideology,” *Liberating Image*, 121. He’s saying that here we find the seeds of the democratic ideal we so cherish today—that all men and women are created equal.
9. In calling us “image of God,” Middleton concludes, it “must be acknowledged as one of the most daring acts of theological imagination within Scripture . . . [It] crystallize[s] the central Israelite insight about being human in a term typically applied only to idols, kings, and priests—and thereby profoundly affected the worldview and theological imagination of generations of biblical readers,” *Liberating Image*, 231.
10. C. S. Lewis, *The Weight of Glory* (New York: Macmillan, 1980), 19.
11. Carl R. Rogers, “Reinhold Niebuhr’s *The Self and the Dramas of History*: A Criticism,” *Pastoral Psychology* 9 (June 1958): 17, cited in Hoekema, *Created in God’s Image*, 105.
12. Joel Lovell, “George Saunders’s Advice to Graduates,” 6th Floor, July 31, 2013, http://6thfloor.blogs.nytimes.com/2013/07/31/george-saunderss-advice-to-graduates/?_r=1.
13. Illustration from Derek Tidball, “Holiness: Restoring God’s Image,” in *Sanctification: Explorations in Theology and Practice*, ed. Kelly M. Kopic (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2014), Kindle locations 273–86.

NOTES

14. Dante Alighieri, *Purgatorio*, XVII.104–5, trans. Allen Mandelbaum (New York: Bantam Classics, 1984), 157.
15. For a recent treatment of the contemporary significance of Dante’s poem, see Rod Dreher, *How Dante Can Save Your Life: The Life-Changing Wisdom of History’s Greatest Poem* (New York: Regan Arts, 2015), Kindle location 77.
16. Peter Kreeft, *Christianity for Modern Pagans: Pascal’s Pensées Edited, Outlined, and Explained* (San Francisco: Ignatius, 1993), 313–14.
17. Pascal, quoted in Kreeft, *Christianity*, 313.
18. Karl Barth, quoted in Adam Neder, *Participation in Christ: An Entry into Karl Barth’s Church “Dogmatics”* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 2009), Kindle locations 582–83.
19. Kevin DeYoung puts it this way: “God does want you to be the real you. He does want you to be true to yourself. But the ‘you’ he’s talking about is the ‘you’ that you are by grace, not by nature.” *The Hole in Our Holiness: Filling the Gap between Gospel Passion and the Pursuit of Godliness* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2012), 100.
20. P. T. O’Brien, quoted in Tidball, “Holiness,” Kindle locations 346–47.
21. John Calvin, *Hebrews and 1 and 2 Peter*, Calvin’s New Testament Commentaries (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans, 1994), 330.
22. Walker Percy, “Diagnosing the Modern Malaise,” *Signposts in a Strange Land* (New York: Noonday, 1991), 213.
23. D. Martyn Lloyd-Jones, *Spiritual Depression: Its Causes and Cures* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans, 1965), 75.
24. Leanne Payne, *The Healing Presence: Curing the Soul through Union with Christ* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 1995), 12.
25. C. S. Lewis, *The Problem of Pain* (New York: Collier Macmillan, 1962), 42–43.

CHAPTER 9: A NEW PURPOSE: WHAT AM I HERE FOR?

1. Søren Kierkegaard, *Papers and Journals: A Selection* (New York: Penguin, 1996), 295.
2. Walker Percy, “Diagnosing the Modern Malaise,” *Signposts in a Strange Land* (New York: Noonday, 1991), 213.

3. Widely attributed to Luther (unspecified). Luther also wrote in his *Preface to Romans*, “Faith cannot help doing good works constantly.... Anyone who does not do good works in this manner is an unbeliever.... Thus, it is just as impossible to separate faith and works as it is to separate heat and light from fire!” And Calvin, in his *Antidote to the Council of Trent*, “I wish the reader to understand that as often as we mention faith alone in this question, we are not thinking of a dead faith, which worketh not by love, but holding faith to be the only cause of justification. (Galatians 5:6; Romans 3:22.) It is therefore faith alone which justifies, and yet the faith which justifies is not alone: just as it is the heat alone of the sun which warms the earth, and yet in the sun it is not alone, because it is constantly conjoined with light.”
4. J. I. Packer, *Rediscovering Holiness: Know the Fullness of Life with God* (Ventura, CA: Gospel Light, 2009), 33.
5. This is the Scripture verse on the cover of one of the first Christian books I ever read in college, *The Pursuit of Holiness* by Jerry Bridges (Colorado Springs: NavPress, 1990). For other classic works on the call of holiness for the Christian life, see *Holiness* by J. C. Ryle, *The Holiness of God* by R. C. Sproul, and more recently, *The Hole in Our Holiness* by Kevin DeYoung.
6. “Forgiven Knightley,” *Sun*, accessed March 24, 2016, www.thesun.co.uk/sol/homepage/showbiz/bizarre/4285973/Atheist-actress-Keira-Knightley-wishes-she-believed-in-God.html.
7. Dana Dirksen, “What Were Adam and Eve Like When God Made Them?,” *Questions with Answers Vol. 1: God and Creation* © 2006 Songs for Saplings.
8. *The Works of Jonathan Edwards*, vols. 1–2 (Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 2011), Kindle locations 28482–84.
9. *Collected Writings of John Murray, Vol. 2: Systematic Theology* (Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 1977), 277.
10. J. C. Ryle, quoted in Kevin DeYoung, *The Hole in Our Holiness: Filling the Gap between Gospel Passion and the Pursuit of Godliness* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2012), 11.
11. Augustus Toplady, “Rock of Ages, Cleft for Me,” *Trinity Hymnal* (Atlanta: Great Commission, 1990), 499.
12. Herman Bavinck, quoted in G. C. Berkouwer, *Faith and Sanctification* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1980), 22.

NOTES

13. Walter Marshall, *The Gospel Mystery of Sanctification: Growing in Holiness by Living in Union with Christ* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2005), 10.
14. Pindar, *Pythian 2*, line 72.
15. Jerry Bridges, *The Pursuit of Holiness* (Colorado Springs: NavPress, 1990), 14.
16. Both Sinclair Ferguson (*The Holy Spirit* [Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 1996], 105) and Kevin DeYoung (*Hole in Our Holiness*, 104) reference the power of union with Christ as an aid against temptation.
17. Romano Guardini, *The Mystery of Grace*, in *Prayers from Theology*, posted on The Christocentric Life, June 25, 2011, <http://christocentriclife.blogspot.com/2011/06/mystery-of-grace-by-romano-guardini.html>.
18. *Letters of Samuel Rutherford* (Carlisle, PA: Puritan Paperbacks, 2006), 167.

CHAPTER 10: A NEW HOPE: WHAT CAN I HOPE FOR?

1. Sherry Turkle, *Alone Together: Why We Expect More from Technology and Less from Each Other* (New York: Basic Books, 2011), 11.
2. Thomas Wolfe, “God’s Lonely Man,” in *The Hills Beyond* (New York: Plume/New American Library, 1982), 146.
3. There are a few excellent treatments on the continuing importance of the ascension out there. Elyse Fitzpatrick’s *The Continuing Importance of the Incarnation*. Gerrit Dawson’s *Jesus Ascended* is well worth your time. For more advanced treatments, see T. F. Torrance’s *Atonement*, Julie Canlis’s *Calvin’s Ladder*, and Douglas Farrow’s *Ascension and Ecclesia*.
4. The Apostle’s Creed.
5. That God created “the heavens and the earth” (Gen. 1:1) demands that we think differently about how the whole cosmos is, so to speak, put together. But heaven and earth are not simply two different locations. They are two different dimensions of God’s creation beyond what we can see or observe. “Certainly the church, just because it believes that God in Christ has given himself to creation as its *Lord*, has something unique to say about the way creation is ordered.” Douglas Farrow, *Ascension and Ecclesia* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1999), x.
6. N. T. Wright, *Simply Jesus: A New Vision of Who He Was, What He Did, and Why He Matters* (New York: HarperCollins, 2011), 196.

7. J. I. Packer, *Knowing God* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 1993), 102. Packer actually uses this illustration as an example of a mistaken understanding of the gift of God's wisdom—that it would be a mistake to expect God to ever take us up into the control room to let us see how everything fits together.
8. Philip Yancey, *The Jesus I Never Knew* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1995), 229.
9. Ian McEwan, *Atonement* (New York: Anchor Books, 2007), 479.
10. 1 Pet. 3:22; Eph. 1:20–21, Mark 14:62.
11. James B. Torrance, *Worship, Community and the Triune God of Grace* (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 1996), 47–50.
12. See Heb. 2:17; 1 Tim. 2:5; Isa. 49:16; Heb. 9:12, 22; Heb. 7:27; John 1:29; Heb. 9:26; Mark 15:38.
13. John Owen, whom I've referenced several times in this book, wrote a great deal about the priesthood of Christ. "The Lord underwent the punishment due to our sins in the judgment of God, and according to the sentence of the law; for how did God make our sins to meet on him, how did he bear them, if he did not suffer the penalty due to them, or if he underwent some other inconvenience, but not the exact demerit of sin?" *The Priesthood of Christ: Its Necessity and Nature* (Fearn, Scotland: Christian Heritage, 2010), 17.
14. C. S. Lewis, *Mere Christianity* (Glasgow: Collins Fount Paperbacks, 1982), 123.
15. The Heidelberg Catechism says it this way: "Q. 49. What benefit do we receive from Christ's ascension into heaven? First, that He is our Advocate in the presence of His Father in heaven. Second, that we have our flesh in heaven as a sure pledge, that He as the Head, will also take us, His members, up to Himself. Third, that He sends us His Spirit as an earnest, by whose power we seek those things which are above, where Christ sits at the right hand of God, and not things on the earth."
16. As described in Barbara Brown Taylor, "The Day We Were Left Behind," *Christianity Today*, May 18, 1998, www.christianitytoday.com/ct/1998/may18/8t6046.html. Julie Canlis, in her book on the importance of the ascension for the theology of John Calvin, adds, "For Calvin, the ladder is Christ—not in the facile explanation that 'Christ is the way,' but that our ascent is profoundly bound up in Christ's ascension, by our *participation in his descent* ... His ascent is our path and goal. His narrative has become our own." *Calvin's Ladder* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2010), 50–51.

NOTES

17. Gerrit Scott Dawson, *Jesus Ascended* (Phillipsburg, NJ: P&R, 2004), 7. Of the books on the ascension I mentioned earlier, Dawson's has been the most helpful to me. And I am indebted to him for pointing me toward several of the early church references in this chapter.
18. Elyse M. Fitzpatrick, *Found in Him: The Joy of the Incarnation and Our Union with Christ* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2013), 44.
19. See Taylor, "The Day We Were Left Behind," www.christianitytoday.com/ct/1998/may18/8t6046.html.
20. "Let us remember how far the secret power of the Holy Spirit towers above all our senses, and how foolish it is to wish to measure his immeasurableness by our measure. What, then, our mind does not comprehend, let faith conceive: that the Spirit truly unites things separated in space." John Calvin, *Institutes*, 4.17.10.
21. Robert Hass, "Privilege of Being," in *Human Wishes* (New York: Ecco, 1989), 69–70.

CHAPTER 11: THE ART OF ABIDING

1. A favorite reminder of Dallas Willard (*The Great Omission: Rediscovering Jesus' Essential Teachings on Discipleship* [San Francisco: HarperOne, 2006], 61). Martin Luther also writes, "What Augustine says is true, 'He who has created you without you will not save you without you.' Works are necessary to salvation, but they do not cause salvation, because faith alone gives life." Quoted by Bernhard Lohse in *Martin Luther's Theology* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1999), 265.
2. Walter Meller, *Village Homilies* (London: W. Skeffington and Son, 1878), 182.
3. Quoted in Marcus Peter Johnson, *One with Christ: An Evangelical Theology of Salvation* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2013), 49.
4. John Owen, *Overcoming Sin and Temptation*, ed. Kelly M. Kopic and Justin Taylor (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2006), 332.
5. *The Works of Jonathan Edwards*, vols. 1–2 (Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 2011), Kindle location 67575.
6. We can hold on to him only because Christ first holds on to us, a point we will stress in the next chapter (2 Tim. 2:13).

7. David Brooks, *The Road to Character* (New York: Random, 2015), Kindle location 5044. Though Brooks is not writing specifically of the Christian life, but of character development in general, his question is still pertinent.
8. Christina Rossetti, “Up-hill,” in *Rosetti: Everyman’s Library Pocket Poets* (New York: Knopf, 1993), 248.
9. Quoted in Alister E. McGrath, *T. F. Torrance: An Intellectual Biography* (London: T & T Clark, 1999), 74.
10. Thanks to Bill Bright for the image of spiritual breathing.
11. Oswald Chambers, *My Utmost for His Highest*, “June 14.”
12. Robert Robinson, “Come, Thou Fount of Every Blessing,” in *Trinity Hymnal* (Atlanta: Great Commission, 1990), 457.
13. An oft-quoted summary of the *Rule of St. Benedict*.

CHAPTER 12: THE MEANS OF ABIDING

1. The importance of spiritual exercises is not unique to the Christian tradition. For example, the Stoic philosopher Seneca trained his pupils to examine at the end of each day their behavior and attitudes for that day—where they failed to live up to their Stoic ideals.
2. Richard J. Foster, *Celebration of Discipline: The Path to Spiritual Growth* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1978), 7.
3. John Jefferson Davis, *Meditation and Communion with God: Contemplating Scripture in an Age of Distraction* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2012), Kindle locations 723–27.
4. Eugene Peterson, *Eat This Book: A Conversation in the Art of Spiritual Reading* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans, 2006), 4.
5. Mother Teresa, *The Joy in Loving: A Guide to Daily Living* (New York: Penguin, 2000), 108.
6. Oscar Wilde, *An Ideal Husband*.
7. Oswald Chambers, *My Utmost for His Highest*, “May 25.”
8. See Jerry Sittser, *When God Doesn’t Answer Your Prayer* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2007), esp. ch. 4.

NOTES

9. Charles E. Moore, ed., *Provocations: Spiritual Writings of Kierkegaard* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2009), 349.
10. Robert Rayburn, “Should Christians Observe the Sabbath?” *Presbyterion* 10 (Spring–Fall 1984), 74.
11. For more on how union with Christ transforms our experience of worship, see James B. Torrance’s *Worship, Community and the Triune God*. I understand it’s a loaded thought, that Christ is our worship leader. It deserves a fuller treatment, and Torrance’s book is a good place to whet your imagination.
12. Augustine defined sacraments as “a visible form of an invisible grace,” quoted in Leonard Vander Zee, *Christ, Baptism and the Lord’s Supper* (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2004), 29.
13. Westminster Confession of Faith, 28.1: “Baptism is a sacrament of the New Testament, ordained by Jesus Christ, not only for the solemn admission of the party baptized into the visible Church; but also, to be unto him a sign and seal of the covenant of grace, of his ingrafting into Christ, of regeneration, of remission of sins, and of his giving up unto God, through Jesus Christ, to walk in newness of life. Which sacrament is, by Christ’s own appointment, to be continued in His Church until the end of the world.”
14. This too is an expansive subject that deserves more than an endnote. For a good primer on the place of the sacraments in the church’s life, see Vander Zee’s *Christ, Baptism and the Lord’s Supper*. Or, for a more technical treatment, Keith Mathison’s *Given for You*. Or, for the most interested, Brian Gerrish’s *Grace and Gratitude*. The Reformation debates concerning the Lord’s Supper almost all assumed Christ was present in the sacrament. The question was always *how*? How is Christ present? This question divided Catholics and Luther and Calvin and Ulrich Zwingli. But even Zwingli himself (whose name is associated with the “memorialist” position) was not a memorialist in the sense of believing the signs were completely divorced from the reality they represented. On this point, Luther, Calvin, and the Catholic Church agreed—the elements were not simply bare remembrances. Each camp believed Christ was truly present. Their question was *how*, and why it mattered. Our aversion to the real spiritual power of the Lord’s Supper today—as an ongoing means of grace—has much less to do with our biblical fidelity and much more to do with our Enlightenment worldview.
15. Calvin, *Institutes*, 4.17.7, 4.17.32.
16. Dietrich Bonhoeffer, *Life Together* (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1954), 23.

17. See Wesley Hill's book, *Spiritual Friendship* (Grand Rapids, MI: Brazos, 2015).
18. *The Works of Jonathan Edwards*, vols. 1–2 (Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 2011), Kindle locations 1582–84.
19. *Works of Jonathan Edwards*, vols. 1–2, Kindle locations 1545–47.
20. Blaise Pascal, *Pensées* (New York: Penguin Books, 1995), 285–86.
21. Anthony Trollope, *An Autobiography* (New York: Dodd, Mead, 1912), 105.
22. Chuck Close, quoted in Mason Currey, *Daily Rituals: How Artists Work* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2014), 64. Currey's book is a delightful sampling that I'd recommend to any one interested in how daily rituals can foster creativity.

CHAPTER 13: THE SECRET OF ABIDING

1. “All right knowledge of God is born of obedience,” writes John Calvin, *Institutes*, I.6.2, echoing Jesus's statement in John 14. For more on this idea, see John Owen, *Communion with the Triune God*, ed. Kelly M. Kapic and Justin Taylor (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2007), 21. For a contemporary gloss on this idea, see Kevin DeYoung, *The Hole in Our Holiness: Filling the Gap between Gospel Passion and the Pursuit of Godliness* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2012), 124–31.
2. Samuel Rutherford, letter to Earlston, younger, June 16, 1637, in *Letters of Samuel Rutherford* (Carlisle, PA: Puritan Paperbacks, 2006), 87.
3. John Owen, *Communion with God*, from *The Essential Works of John Owen*, Kindle locations 42928–29.
4. Owen, *Communion*, Kindle locations 42865–66.

CHAPTER 14: THE NECESSARY PATH OF ABIDING: SUFFERING

1. Timothy Keller, *Walking with God through Pain and Suffering* (New York: Dutton, 2013), 30.
2. John Calvin, *The Golden Booklet of the True Christian Life* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 2004), 48.
3. If Jesus is the perfect embodiment of the image of God—what God intends humanity to be—and Jesus's life was oriented toward a cross, and this cross

NOTES

- was necessary for him and necessary for us, then it's a provocative question: What does the cross of Jesus have to tell us about what it means to be human? What does the cross tell us about the art of living?
4. Yes, the Lord *may* be using suffering to discipline us (Heb. 12:3–11), but the author of Hebrews is clear to say that this discipline is a reflection of our Father's love, not a punishment for sin that needs atoning for (10:10).
 5. George Macdonald, *Unspoken Sermons*, First Series, quoted in C. S. Lewis, *The Problem of Pain* (New York: Collier Macmillan, 1962), 7.
 6. Horatio G. Spafford, "It Is Well with My Soul," in *Trinity Hymnal* (Atlanta: Great Commission, 1990), 691.
 7. Keller, *Walking with God*, 312.
 8. *Selma*, directed by Ava DuVernay (London: Cloud Eight, 2014).

CHAPTER 15: EVERY DAY—UNION WITH THE COSMIC CHRIST

1. Robert N. Bellah, et al., *Habits of the Heart: Individualism and Commitment in American Life* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1985), 21.
2. Bellah, *Habits*, 65.
3. Dietrich Bonhoeffer, *Life Together* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2015), 13.
4. D. A. Carson, *Love in Hard Places* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2002), 61.
5. Charles Wesley, "And Can It Be That I Should Gain," in *Trinity Hymnal* (Atlanta: Great Commission, 1990), 455.
6. Christopher Lasch, *The Culture of Narcissism: American Life in an Age of Diminishing Expectations* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1979).
7. A popular way of personalizing the distinctness of Christ's love. To be certain, the gospel must be personal (Gal. 2:20), but it can never remain private.
8. Once again I'm talking about the "New Perspective on Paul" and its challenge to the traditional Protestant understanding of justification. Is justification primarily a soteriological category, how one "gets into" the people of God? Or is it primarily an ecclesiological category, who's "in" the people of God? Five hundred years before modern scholars began to argue that ecclesiology and soteriology were inseparable, John Calvin made the very same argument, and without compromising justification as a legal, forensic category. At the same

time, Calvin has the highest view of the church and could agree that “outside of the church there is no salvation,” because for him, to be in Christ was inseparable from being part of Christ’s body, the church.

9. See the Westminster Confession of Faith 25.2: “The visible church ... is the kingdom of the Lord Jesus Christ, the house and family of God, out of which there is no ordinary possibility of salvation.”
10. For a much richer treatment of why this is a false dichotomy, see *Exploring Ecclesiology* by Brad Harper and Paul Louis Metzger.
11. For an example of the false choice we may be presented with today, here’s a representative quote from a recent book on the mission of the church: “We know this sounds heartless, but it’s true: it simply was not Jesus’s driving ambition to heal the sick and meet the needs of the poor, as much as he cared for them. He was sent into the world to save people from condemnation (John 3:17), that he might be lifted up so believers could have eternal life (3:14–15).”
12. Lesslie Newbigin, *The Open Secret: An Introduction to the Theology of Mission*, rev. ed. (Grand Rapids, MI: W. B. Eerdmans, 1995), 63–64.
13. Without compromising one bit that the gospel is “good news” to be announced. We don’t add to the gospel or complete it in any way. We proclaim it. And we adorn it with the quality of our lives and the concern of our hearts (see Titus 2:10).
14. See Calvin, *Institutes*, 3.11.6: “Christ cannot be torn into parts, so these two which we perceive in him together and conjointly are inseparable.”
15. Tennessee Williams, *Small Craft Warnings*, Act II, in *The Theatre of Tennessee Williams: The Milk Train Doesn’t Stop Here Anymore ...* (New York: New Directions, 1990), 284.
16. See Robert D. Putnam, *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2001).
17. Quoted in Ralph C. Wood, “In Defense of Disbelief,” *First Things*, October 1998.
18. Richard Bauckham, *The Theology of the Book of Revelation* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 58.
19. Lesslie Newbigin, *The Gospel in a Pluralist Society* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1989), 103.

NOTES

20. Charles Taylor, *A Secular Age* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap Harvard, 2007).
21. This is one of the more exciting and provocative fields of twentieth-century New Testament scholarship. See G. B. Caird's *Principalities and Powers*, Walter Wink's *The Powers* (three volumes), Marva Dawn's *Powers, Weakness, and the Tabernacling of God* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2001), and Lesslie Newbigin's *The Gospel in a Pluralist Society* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1989). Newbigin sums up, "The principalities and powers are real. They are invisible ... [but] they meet us as embodied in visible and tangible realities—people, nations, and institutions. And they are powerful ... they are created in Christ and for Christ; their true end is to serve him ... but they become powers for evil when they attempt to usurp the place which belongs to Christ alone.... They are at the heart of our business as Christians" (207–8). "If we dismiss this as merely outworn mythology, we shall be incapable of grasping the central message of the New Testament" (210). Marva Dawn quotes Thomas R. Yoder Neufeld, who says, "[The powers'] demonic character rests ... in their capacity to control the imaginations and behaviors of human beings, individually and communally" (2).
22. Drawing on the work of G. B. Caird, Lesslie Newbigin says that one of the best places in the New Testament to observe how these powers conspire in the world is to ask the question, who killed Jesus? There were various visible historic forces: religious leaders, such as Caiaphas; political leaders, such as Pontius Pilate and Herod; social forces, including the mob who yelled, "Crucify him." Are they *solely* to blame? Paul wrote to the church at Corinth some twenty-five years later, "The rulers of this age, who are doomed to pass away ... crucified the Lord of glory" (1 Cor. 2:6, 8). It's clear Paul isn't talking about Herod and Pilate. They have already passed away. He is not just talking about an individual called Herod or Pilate. He is talking about something working behind the scenes in and through these officeholders—a very real power embodied in and exercised by human beings but not identical with them. It's not that these human actors don't have responsibility, but it is to say that Caiaphas, Herod, and Pilate were not just a few wicked men. They were acting as temporary agents, of something more fundamental and more enduring than their own individual opinions. This is not to say that all structures are evil, but that all things were created by Christ and for Christ, including these powers and principalities and that they can be taken captive by spiritual powers and become agents of rebellion. See "Principalities, Powers, and People," ch. 16 in *The Gospel in a Pluralist Society* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1989). John Stott adds, "That social, political, judicial and

- economic structures can become demonic is evident to anybody that has considered that the state, which in Romans 13 is the minister of God, in Revelation 13 has become an ally of the devil.” *The Message of Ephesians* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 1979), 274.
23. N. T. Wright adds, “The cross was not the defeat of *Christ* at the hands of the *powers*; it was the defeat of the powers at the hands—yes, the bleeding hands—of Christ.” *Following Jesus: Biblical Reflections on Discipleship* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1994), 19.
 24. F. F. Bruce, *The Epistles to the Colossians, to Philemon, and to the Ephesians* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans, 1984), 111.
 25. Newbigin, *Gospel in a Pluralist Society*, 208.
 26. Sinclair Ferguson, *The Christian Life: A Doctrinal Introduction* (Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 2013), 101.
 27. Robert Frost, “Desert Places,” in *The Poetry of Robert Frost* (New York: Owl Book, Henry Holt, 1979), 296.
 28. John Murray, *Redemption Accomplished and Applied* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1955), 168.
 29. Jonathan Edwards. “There was, [as] it were, an eternal society or family in the Godhead, in the Trinity of persons. It seems to be God’s design to admit the church into the divine family as his son’s wife.” Quoted in Brad Harper and Paul Louis Metzger, *Exploring Ecclesiology: An Evangelical and Ecumenical Introduction* (Grand Rapids, MI: Brazos, 2009), 37.
 30. For John Owen, this is the structure of his masterwork *Communion with God*. Owen divides his book between communion with each member of the Trinity and uses 2 Corinthians 13:14 as his launching point: “The grace of the Lord Jesus Christ, and the love of God, and the communion of the Holy Ghost, *be with you all*” (KJV).

FINAL WORD: A PRAYER FOR UNION WITH CHRIST

1. D. Martyn Lloyd-Jones, *The Unsearchable Riches of Christ: An Exposition of Ephesians 3:1–21* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 1980), 6.